<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Intended Result</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Status and timeframe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation 2.1. To enhance the relevance and effectiveness of the WGWAP process, IUCN, supported by Sakhalin Energy, must continue efforts to engage other energy companies on the Sakhalin Shelf in the process, both formally and informally.</td>
<td>IUCN agrees with this recommendation.</td>
<td>Other energy companies working on the Sakhalin Shelf actively engage with the WGWAP, formally or informally, provide information on their activities and fully or partially implement WGWAP recommendations.</td>
<td>• Document lessons learned from WGWAP process and use these to market the ideas and concepts to other energy companies, their lenders and relevant Russian governmental bodies</td>
<td>• WGW Programme Officer</td>
<td>• One or more energy companies are actively engaged in the WGWAP process (either participating in WGWAP meetings and/or becoming a contracting company)</td>
<td>2012 and beyond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Arrange high-level meetings between WGWAP Chair and Russian Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment, relevant energy companies and State Duma</td>
<td>• Sakhalin Energy</td>
<td>• One or more energy companies provide information on their activities and implement WGWAP’s recommendations on a regular basis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation 2.2. To enhance the relevance of the WGWAP process for IUCN, IUCN’s Global Marine and Polar Programme (GMPP) should ensure adequate interaction, engagement and cross-fertilisation with and between the WGWAP’s work and other relevant activities of the Secretariat and Commissions.</td>
<td>IUCN agrees with this recommendation.</td>
<td>The funding for the rangewide initiative for the western grey whale is secured.</td>
<td>• Develop and implement effective fundraising strategy to secure funding for the rangewide initiative the western grey whale in collaboration with IWC and relevant NGOs and IGOs</td>
<td>• WGW Programme Officer, WGWAP Chair, Greg Donovan, Dave Weller and Robert L. Brownell, Jr. (in collaboration with IWC and relevant NGOs)</td>
<td>• Sufficient funding for rangewide initiative for the western grey whale is secured by IUCN</td>
<td>2012 and beyond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Engage relevant NGOs, IGOs and governments and obtain their support for the rangewide initiative for the western grey whale</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Relevant NGOs, IGOs and governments support and/or engaged into the rangewide initiative for the western gray whale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation 2.3. To enhance the relevance of the WGWAP process for IUCN, IUCN’s Global Marine and Polar Programme (GMPP) should ensure adequate interaction, engagement and cross-fertilisation with and between the WGWAP’s work and that of its other projects and activities, as well as the Business and Biodiversity Programme and other relevant activities of the Secretariat and Commissions.</td>
<td>IUCN agrees with this recommendation.</td>
<td>Adequate interaction, engagement and cross-fertilisation are ensured between the WGWAP’s work and the Business and Biodiversity Programme, as well as with other relevant activities of the Secretariat and Commissions.</td>
<td>• Organise a meeting for IUCN staff to inform them about WGWAP’s work</td>
<td>• WGW Programme Officer</td>
<td>• Lessons learned from the WGWAP process are well documented, analysed and provided to relevant IUCN Programmes and Commissions</td>
<td>2012 and beyond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Send regular updates about WGWAP process to IUCN Programmes and Commissions</td>
<td>• WGW logistic and communication officer</td>
<td>• One or more Programmes and Commissions are using best practices and lessons learned from the WGWAP process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Liaise with other IUCN Programmes and Commissions to identify and work on issues of</td>
<td>• Director of GMPP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Recommendation numbers are keyed to chapter numbers in the report.
**Recommendation 2.4.** IUCN should affirm its commitment to, and clarify its procedures for, acting both as neutral convenor of the WGWAP and also as active conservation advocate on matters addressed by the panel.

**IUCN partially agrees with this recommendation.** IUCN’s commitment and procedures for acting as a neutral convenor are clearly stated in the TOR and effectively implemented by IUCN. The Panel, Sakhalin Energy and observers regularly express their appreciation of IUCN commitment and the procedures at WGWAP meetings and beyond.

IUCN agrees that it should play an active conservation advocacy role on matters addressed by the panel, has done so and will continue to do so in consultation with the Panel, Sakhalin Energy and relevant NGOs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Responsible Party</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Develop, in consultation with WGWAP members, Sakhalin Energy and relevant NGOs, and implement an effective conservation advocacy plan</td>
<td>WGW Programme Officer, WGW Logistics and Communications Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The independence of the panel is effectively maintained by IUCN</td>
<td>IUCN’s advocacy contributes to promotion of Panel’s recommendations and best practices in the energy sector</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2012

**Recommendation 3.1.** Sakhalin Energy should ensure that it delivers a full and timely flow of information regarding the South Piltun development to the panel.

**IUCN agrees with this recommendation.**

A full and timely flow of information from Sakhalin Energy to the panel regarding the South Piltun development is ensured.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Responsible Party</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liaise with Sakhalin Energy to ensure full and timely flow of information regarding the South Piltun development to the panel</td>
<td>WGW Programme Officer, Sakhalin Energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure that the South Piltun development topic is included in the WGWAP meeting agenda</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organize regular conference calls in order to update Panel members on the topic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sufficient information regarding the South Piltun development in provided to the panel in a timely manner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2012 and beyond

**Recommendation 3.2.** The panel should continue its efforts to improve the specificity, clarity and practicability of its recommendations.

**IUCN agrees with this recommendation.**

The Panel’s recommendations are specific, measurable, achievable, time-bound and reflect requirements set up in the TOR for them.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Responsible Party</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Work with the WGWAP Chair and panel members to ensure that Panel recommendations are specific, measurable, achievable, time-bound and reflect requirements set up in the TOR for them</td>
<td>WGWAP members, WGW Programme Officer, Sakhalin Energy, WGW Logistics and Communications Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The percentage of recommendations in the category “Rejected by SE”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2012 and beyond
### Recommendation 3.3. IUCN should ensure that arrangements for substantively filling the WGWAP coordinator position are clearly communicated and fully understood by all stakeholders.

IUCN agrees with this recommendation. This recommendation has been implemented satisfactorily and closed.

| IUCN agrees with this recommendation. | Russian authorities and the Inter-departmental Working Group are actively involved in the WGWAP process. | Establish and maintain good communication and exchange of information with the Russian Federal Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment and the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment of the Sakhalin Oblast | Send invitations to the Russian authorities and the Interdepartmental Working Group to participate in the WGWAP meetings | Establish and maintain good communication and exchange of information with the Interdepartmental Working Group | Send WGWAP reports to the Russian authorities and the Inter-departmental Working Group | WGWAP Chair | Russian members of WGWAP | Director of GMPP | WGW Programme Officer | WGW Logistics and Communications Officer | WGWAP and the Interdepartmental Working Group maintain good communication and exchange of information with each other | WGWAP maintains good communication and exchange of information with the Russian Federal Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MNR) and the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MNR) of the Sakhalin Oblast | A permanent representative(s) from Federal MNR and/or MNR of Sakhalin Oblast regularly attend(s) WGWAP meetings | 2012 and beyond |

### Recommendation 3.4. IUCN, its GMPP and the WGWAP should strengthen their interaction with the Russian authorities and the Interdepartmental Working Group (IWG) with regard to the WGWAP process.

IUCN agrees with this recommendation. Russian authorities and the Inter-departmental Working Group are actively involved in the WGWAP process.

| Establish and maintain good communication and exchange of information with the Russian Federal Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment and the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment of the Sakhalin Oblast | Send invitations to the Russian authorities and the Interdepartmental Working Group to participate in the WGWAP meetings | Establish and maintain good communication and exchange of information with the Interdepartmental Working Group | Send WGWAP reports to the Russian authorities and the Inter-departmental Working Group | WGWAP Chair | Russian members of WGWAP | Director of GMPP | WGW Programme Officer | WGW Logistics and Communications Officer | WGWAP and the Interdepartmental Working Group maintain good communication and exchange of information with each other | WGWAP maintains good communication and exchange of information with the Russian Federal Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MNR) and the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MNR) of the Sakhalin Oblast | A permanent representative(s) from Federal MNR and/or MNR of Sakhalin Oblast regularly attend(s) WGWAP meetings | 2012 and beyond |

### Recommendation 3.5. IUCN and Sakhalin Energy should support closer interaction between the panel and local authorities and NGOs on Sakhalin.

IUCN agrees with this recommendation. Active involvement of Sakhalin Oblast and local NGOs to WGWAP process.

| Organize a local meeting on Sakhalin Island to exchange information and opinions and establish good communication with the Sakhalin’s Oblast and local NGOs | Send invitations to the Sakhalin’s Oblast and local NGOs to participate in the WGWAP meetings | Send WGWAP reports to the Sakhalin’s Oblast and local NGOs | WGW Programme Officer | Sakhalin Energy | WGW logistic and communication officer | WGWAP members | The Ministry of Natural Resources, governmental bodies and local NGOs from the Sakhalin Oblast are actively engaged into the WGWAP process | Representatives from the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MNR), other relevant governmental bodies of the Sakhalin Oblast and local NGOs regularly attend WGWAP meetings | 2012 and beyond |

### Recommendation 3.6. Before each meeting, the panel chair and the IUCN coordinator should prepare a short document assessing the

<p>| A WGWAP performance assessment is prepared and disseminated to participants at least 2 weeks prior to every WGWAP meeting. | Assess performance of the WGWAP and disseminate the results of the assessment to participants at least 2 weeks prior to | WGW Programme Officer | WGWAP Chair in consultation with Sakhalin Energy, WGWAP members and observers | An assessment of WGWAP performance is completed and disseminated to participants at least 2 weeks prior to every WGWAP | 2012 and beyond |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation 3.7.</th>
<th>IUCN agrees with this recommendation.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A consultative mechanism that allows wide participation of other energy companies, NGOs and local and national government in the WGWAP process is organized.</td>
<td>Prepare and implement an action plan in close collaboration with Sakhalin Energy to facilitate consultation and involvement of other energy companies, NGOs and local and national government in the WGWAP process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document lessons learned from WGWAP process and use these to market the ideas and concepts to other organisations, donors, etc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation 4.1.</td>
<td>IUCN agrees with this recommendation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A 360° review of Panel members is performed on a regular basis.</td>
<td>Perform the 360° review of panel members on an regular basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If one member has to be replaced, replace him/her with a candidate with strong practical experience of addressing environmental and technical concerns from within the oil and gas sector and/or a Russian national should be chosen to replace him/her.</td>
<td>If one member has to be replaced, replace him/her with a candidate with strong practical experience of addressing environmental and technical concerns from within the oil and gas sector and/or a Russian national.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation 4.2.</td>
<td>IUCN agrees with this recommendation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task forces meetings are maintained with a special emphasis on the independence of each Panel member’s stance. The decisions of the private and plenary meetings of the panel as a whole take into account whole range of the panel members’ opinions.</td>
<td>Organise task force meetings on a regular basis where IUCN acts as a neutral convenor and ensures that whole spectrum of panel member opinions is taken into consideration in the process of recommendation-making.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation 4.3.</td>
<td>IUCN agrees with this recommendation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitate the work of the environmental monitoring task force (EMTF) and ensure that it works effectively and provides relevant recommendations in a timely manner.</td>
<td>Consider the possibility of holding an EMTF meeting in 2012.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consult WGWAP members and environmental monitoring experts involved into the work of the environmental monitoring task force on how to facilitate their work and make it more effective.</td>
<td>Regularly update EMTF.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 According to the new TOR (2011), the tenure of members is now subject to a limit, to allow rotation.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations status</th>
<th>Recommendations status</th>
<th>Recommendations status</th>
<th>Recommendations status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the Environmental monitoring category, the percentage of recommendations that are “open” or “closed unsatisfactorily” is reduced from the present 60%</td>
<td>For the Environmental monitoring category, the percentage of recommendations that are “open” or “closed unsatisfactorily” is reduced from the present 60%</td>
<td>For the Environmental monitoring category, the percentage of recommendations that are “open” or “closed unsatisfactorily” is reduced from the present 60%</td>
<td>For the Environmental monitoring category, the percentage of recommendations that are “open” or “closed unsatisfactorily” is reduced from the present 60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recommendation 4.4. Instead of attempting focused information or question and answer sessions on the western grey whale and the WGWAP, IUCN should give prominence to its and the panel’s readiness to answer questions via the website, and actively seek the collaboration of Russian and other NGOs in spreading the word about this. It should also include a ‘frequently asked questions’ link to the fact sheet on the website.

IUCN agrees with this recommendation.

- The IUCN and the Panel demonstrate their readiness to answer questions via the website and spreads the word about this.
- “Ask an expert” and “frequently asked questions” content containers are added to the website.
- Relevant NGOs and IWC place a link to the WGWAP website on their websites.
- The WGWAP website is user-friendly and contains accurate up-to-date information for the general public as well as for scientists.

- Add “Ask an expert” and “frequently asked questions” content containers to the WGWAP website.
- Arrange with relevant NGOs and IWC that a link to the WGWAP website is placed on their websites.
- Ensure that the WGWAP website is user-friendly and contains accurate up-to-date information for the general public as well as for scientists.
- Update website regularly.

- WGW Programme Officer
- WGW Logistics and Communications Officer

- An FAQ (“Frequently Asked Questions”) content container is added on the WGW website.
- An “Ask an expert” content container is added to the WGW website.
- Relevant NGOs and IWC have a link to the WGWAP website on their websites.
- The WGWAP website is user-friendly and contains accurate up-to-date information for the general public as well as for scientists.

2012